

Teacher Compensation Assistance Program Advisory Council
May 28, 2008

Proposed Schedule of Meetings:

1. May 28-current
2. July 7-8
3. July 30-31
4. September 10
- *We are undecided between July 23-24 and August 5-6*-

I. Welcome, Introductions and Purpose of Summer Study

A. Purpose of Summer Study

B. House Bill 1124- **Dr. Melmer**

1. Teacher tenure = What is it and why do we have it?
2. Licensing teachers - Do we give temporary license until teachers have proven themselves?
3. Do we need market compensation?
 - a. More elementary teacher applications than secondary applications because:
 - Content is more challenging
 - Students are more challenging
 - Stakes are higher

C. Purpose of the Study- **Melody Schopp** (PowerPoint available)

1. The council shall examine how teacher quality and teacher salaries in the state can be enhanced, and how the funds appropriated in fiscal year 2010 and in subsequent fiscal years by the state for the teacher compensation assistance program established in § 13-3-73 can best be utilized to assist in that effort.
2. The council shall consider a variety of issues surrounding teachers including market compensation, a tiered licensure system, a system for evaluating teachers, mentoring and induction programs for teachers, and continuing contracts for teachers.
3. The council shall complete its work and the secretary of education shall provide its recommendations to the Governor and to the Executive Board of the Legislative Research Council no later than November 15, 2008.

D. How Did We Get Here?

1. Legislative session 2007 – Teacher Compensation Assistance Program (TCAP)
2. May 15, 2007 – Rules promulgated for TCAP program
3. Legislative Session 2008 – Senate Bill 187

E. More Importantly...Why?

1. Increased awareness of South Dakota's place as 50th or 51st in teacher salaries
2. TCAP attempted to address the issue
 - a. A plan based on district instructional goals, or
 - b. A plan to enhance teacher compensation through market compensation strategies, or
 - c. Both

F. Other Influences

1. Teacher Incentive Fund Grant - \$20 million grant for five years
2. Specific to 10 districts with schools identified as “high need” and in school improvements
3. Explores alternative compensation for teachers to include “performance pay”
4. Also rewards teachers for involvement in professional development and evaluation
5. Provides funds to schools for market compensation
 - a. Districts use the money the way they want

G. 2008 Session

1. Six bills were introduced specific to the teacher salary issue
 - a. Market compensation
 - b. Increase in base salary
 - c. Increased base salary related to teacher quality
2. Senate Bill 187 passed

H. Facilitator John Swanson

1. Works for TIE as an Education Technology Specialist
 - a. Serve as director of a federal grant that works with the American History program
 - b. Leadership development
2. John’s role for these meetings
 - a. Remain neutral
 - b. Keep the group on task
 - c. Direct processes
 - d. Encourage everyone to participate
 - e. Provide a safe environment for the work
 - f. Contribute to agenda planning
 - g. Elicit clarity regarding meeting follow-up

I. Introductions and Answers:

1. Representative Phyllis Heineman
 - Concerned with student achievement and student learning
 - Salary is tied into great teaching
 - Looking forward to listening
 - Expectation- understanding of TCAP funds
2. Joe Graves-Superintendent in Mitchell
 - Unique opportunity to break free of teacher salary...lead to open market and more teachers
 - Expectation- What we do come up with will have an impact for future legislation, not just another document.
3. Dan Guericke-Director of ESA 3
 - This council is a piece of a developing answer to a puzzle
 - * We face unique problems, being a rural state
 - Personnel and dollars are scarce...we need to use both better
 - Exciting...looking for change
 - Expectation- not a solution but a process

4. Lisa McNeely-Teacher in Redfield
 - We are losing some really good teachers
 - It comes down to money...can't always prevent that
 - If enhancing salaries would keep those good teachers here, it is important
 - Expectation- learn more about the process of TCAP and the legislative process
5. Lesli Hanson-Superintendent in Watertown
 - Importance of the future of education
 - The culture of the teaching profession needs to be changed...it is an honorable profession but not viewed as it once was
 - More of dilemma than just paying people
 - Expectation- Change, we have got to change and become better
 - We can't keep doing what we're doing and expect results
6. Jeff Lukens-Teacher in Sioux Falls
 - Quality of applicants has dropped
 - People need to look at higher education
 - Goes beyond the money
 - Want to get good people and people that will stay
 - Expectation- wants something to get done
7. Senator Sandy Jerstad
 - Education is the bedrock of any civilized society
 - Wants this to be the best education system
 - TCAP not a lot of money but hopes it is allocated well and that teachers do not have to do any more work than they already do
8. Luann Lindskov- Teacher in Timber Lake
 - TCAP was giving extra money for work already done
 - Burnout in teachers is a problem
 - Preparing professionals that are not going back into education
 - * Money is an issue for them *
 - Feels responsible that something gets done
 - Expectation- building understanding and team approach to solving teacher issues
9. Sandra Waltman – Government relations for Bryce Healy, South Dakota Education Association
 - Teachers not staying in the profession
 - The future of South Dakota falls on its educators
 - Expectation- honest dialogue...is it salary?...what is it?
10. Pam Homan-Superintendent in Sioux Falls
 - State is at crisis point
 - Applicant pool has declined by 22% in Sioux Falls district
 - The pool of applicants has changed a bit
 - Need every teacher to be effective and high quality every day in every class of every hour
 - Teachers don't care where the money comes from...teachers doing well need to get the money

- Need to look at tenure
- Expectation- multiple pathways...one size does not fit all
- 11. Representative Larry Lucas
 - Clear consensus of group
 - Expectation- decision needs to be based on data and research
 - Need to look at teacher education in the universities
- 12. Sherry Crofut-Teacher in Rapid City
 - Worry about people coming into education
 - Teaching profession needs to be more respected
 - Expectation- learn about TCAP process and other
- 13. Duane Alm-President Associated School Boards of South Dakota
 - Teachers need a high quality environment
 - Salary is a big concern
 - Expectation- we have a document to take to the legislature
- 14. Joseph Harrison- Teacher in Rapid City
 - A chance to build on the profession
 - Expectation- obtain a rationale for what is done in the summer study
- 15. Dennis Rieckman-Superintendent in Wall
 - Retaining teachers is very tough
 - How to get them to stay and get them there
 - Benefits are important
 - Expectation- hopefully part of a solution, not a dog and pony show

People not able to attend: Sharon Andrews, Tom Hawley, Senator Ken Albers, Senator Ken Hansen, Representative Thomas Deadrick

II. Overview of Process for Summer Study...Defining Our Sandbox- **John Swenson**

- Definitions on first page of handbook
- We will look at the five issues, but are not limited to those issues
- We will make recommendations
- A. Defining Our Sandbox
 1. Examine issues
 2. Enlarge Understanding
 3. Determine Findings
 4. Offer Recommendations
- B. Ways of Talking (chart handout)
 1. Seven Norms of Collaboration (handout)
 - (1)Pausing, (2) Paraphrasing, (3) Probing, (4) Putting ideas on the table, (5) Paying attention to self and others, (6) Presuming positive intentions, and (7) Pursuing a balance between advocacy and inquiry
- C. Dialogue and Debate
- D. Quote:
 - “Seek first to understand, then to be understood.”- Stephen Covey

- E. Role of Council Members
 - 1. Attend the meetings
 - 2. Complete assignments
 - 3. Practice the norms of collaboration
- III. History of TCAP Program and Teacher Salary Issue in South Dakota-
 - A. Wade Pogany
 - 1. Talk started in 2005
 - 2. TCAP compliance and usage
 - a. Professional development
 - b. Market compensation...bonus incentive money, etc.
 - c. Setup TCAP board
 - Review all applications
 - Look at program itself and is it meeting expectations
 - d. State board would oversee all of this
 - 3. All schools were approved
 - 4. Summary of Proposed TCAP Activities 2007-2008 (*Handout*)
 - a. Activities evolved and changed
 - b. *Extra money for teachers is not included in salary numbers. The ONLY money being reported is determined by the pay scale.*
 - c. We don't know if South Dakota reports their teacher salaries the same as the rest of the country
 - d. Measuring the goal that the TCAP money helped and how successful was it
 - e. Money was allocated per student, but people were left out like co-op teachers and multi-district teachers
 - f. Distribution of funds was based on application need
 - g. TCAP proposed activities have changed from 2007-2008, more schools are doing similar things
 - h. TCAP money is a supplement not to be used to supplant
 - Can use money to pay for things that are in place
 - TCAP came and paid teachers that were doing unpaid work
 - 5. Questions
 - a. What is the best use for this money?
 - b. Do other states use extra work equals extra pay?
 - c. Did every teacher get to take advantage of the extra funds?
 - The money didn't go to every teacher that was one of the rules. The money could not be divided-up between all of the teachers in the district.
 - They had to participate in the extra professional development days
 - If they did not participate in those, they did not receive the money
 - B. Melody Schopp – Teacher Salary PowerPoint
 - 1. SD continues to rank last in teacher salaries

- a. National average public school teacher salary for 2005–06 was \$49,026.
 - b. South Dakota’s average pay is \$34,709.
 - 2. South Dakota is not the lowest in average beginning pay (47th), but it is the lowest in overall average from the 2005-2006 numbers
 - 3. Comparing this to years of experience
 - a. No correlations appear in the numbers - teacher pay and year’s experience.
 - 4. Is being paid last in the nation a concern?
 - 5. Numbers on salaries, experiences, and enrollment are in *Section C*.
 - 6. Median salary by years of experience
 - a. Teachers work longer to get more pay until they max out on the salary scale.
- C. Questions:
- 1. Teachers are concerned with money as well as every other profession.
 - 2. The number of people that want to get into this field is declining.
 - 3. What can we do for others to keep them in this field?
 - 4. Would this be a different conversation with different people if we were 50th or 51st in the nation on student performance?
 - 5. Are these surveys taking into consideration that teachers don’t get paid for 12 months?
 - 6. How can we get teachers to fill the gaps that are open?
 - 7. Can we look at the Governor’s New Teacher Academy to see what they suggest?

IV. Small Group Discussions and Questions of Summer Study Issues

Market Compensation

- 1. What kind of market are we talking about-regional, state, or both?
- 2. What are we defining market compensation as?
- 3. Should we have retention bonuses for new teachers and incoming teachers?
 - i. Encouraging them to stay.
 - ii. Should there be signing bonus for new teachers, but not for teachers who are staying and not threatening to leave?
- 4. Are fewer applications in South Dakota leading to a teacher quality problem?
 - i. Is there data to support this?
 - ii. Will we be looking at declining test scores?
- 5. What data supports that we have poor quality teachers today?
- 6. Are we going to put school districts in competition to hire the best teachers?
- 7. Why not open it up as a market rather than using price fixing?
- 8. Is it possible to have a tiered compensation package so that teachers in schools of need receive more for staying in higher needs schools?
 - i. What schools have impact aid?
- 9. Is there something we can tap into at the postsecondary level that allows us to identify future teachers and offer to help them pay for school if they go to an area of need for 3-5 years?

10. What is the number of potential teacher graduates coming from South Dakota universities versus the number of teachers leaving the profession?

- i. Supply is not meeting the demand.
- ii. As a state we should be doing more to forgive college loans to help future teachers.

Tiered Licensure Program

1. If there are three tiers to this system, where do veteran teachers start?
 - i. How would that look?
2. Is there research that shows increases in student performance or that advanced degrees show advanced student performance?
3. Does it make sense to make the licensure process more complicated when we have a teacher shortage?
4. Would they have to take another test?
5. What is the purpose of the tiered system?
 - i. Is the purpose to help teachers?
 - ii. What are other states doing and how long have they had it?
6. Should there be some way to have compensation be spread over time?
 - i. Should the base be raised?
 - ii. Should there be incentives for staying over time?
 - iii. Would there be goals and targets to go for?
 - iv. Would there be opportunities for more money?
7. Why does this have to be at the state level?
 - i. In Sioux Falls, there is a 20% increase in year 4 and 5.
8. What about merit pay?

System for Evaluating Teachers

1. What benefit is there to standardizing benefits across the state?
2. Are we trying to fix a problem that we do not have?
 - i. What current info do we have that the evaluation is not working?
3. Could we use a portfolio system for evaluating throughout the year?
4. What different evaluation systems are there throughout the state?
5. If a product is required for teacher evaluations, are the teachers given time in school or is it on the side?
6. Is the current evaluation system appropriate?
 - i. Are students learning?
 - ii. Are the teachers doing their job?
 - iii. Is there a component of student performance?
7. Why did we do away with the requirement to remove the evaluation?
8. If a system were set up what would the effect be on administration?
 - i. Would we have to hire more administrators?

Mentoring

1. Do we need more teacher leaders or administrators?
 - i. Is it a good balance or not to take the good teachers as mentors?
2. Why are students choosing the career areas they are choosing?
3. What are the results from the New Teacher Academy?
 - i. Is it positive or negative?
 - ii. Are the mentors positive or negative?

- iii. Do we have follow up information?
 - iv. National Board Certification as well as mentors
- 4. What are induction programs?
 - i. Do we have models that we are displaying?
 - ii. Are these programs locally determined?
 - iii. What are the components and costs to get everyone on board?
- 5. What models are in place that we could replicate?
- 6. Do teachers that go to larger schools have a higher success rate?

Continuing Contracts

- 1. What data is there that suggests tenure improves student performance?
- 2. How does this eliminate tenure?
 - i. Is it just more hoops to jump through?
- 3. Is the three-year tenure window too small?
 - i. The window should be more like five years.
- 4. What data supports tenure and student achievement?
 - i. What data supports keeping it?
- 5. Why do we have continuing contracts and what are the benefits?
 - i. Who does it protect?
 - ii. How should we change it?
 - iii. Is it merely job security for the underpaid?
- 6. What would happen if changes happened with TCAP?

TCAP Questions

- 1. How detrimental would it be to change TCAP?
- 2. Should there be a blog or Web site that allows administrators to talk about TCAP?
- 3. TCAP should be added into the average teacher salary.
- 4. We need to hear from business managers.
- 5. What does the research data say?
 - i. Who needs to find that?
 - ii. Do they need to bring it back?
- 6. What are we looking for in outcomes with TCAP money?
- 7. What is the legislative intent?
 - i. Is there a state objective?
 - ii. Is the intent student achievement?
- 8. What do you attribute to rising scores?
 - i. How do you point to TCAP or PD and say that is what's doing it?

V. Reflections and Assignments

- A. Handouts were given as an assignment and put in Section D of the book.

VI. Closure